



Free City College Oversight Committee

DRAFT Minutes



Members: Eileen Mariano (Co-Chair), Brigitte Davila (Co-Chair), Dr. Lisa Cooper Wilkins, Nikki Hatfield, Win-Mon Kyi, Angelica Campos, Supervisor Gordon Mar, Jennifer Fong, Maria Su, Alisa Messer, Christopher Brodie, Tyler Wu, Conny Ford, Malinalli Villalobos, Calvin Quock

Date and Time: Monday, September 19th, 2022, 3:00pm-5:00pm

Location: (<https://us06web.zoom.us/j/85048089691?pwd=eE1DMTAXYmRzU0xwYmVWQ0hYYlc3Zz09>

Passcode: 337773); or Join by Telephone: 1-669-900-6833; Webinar ID: 850 4808 9691

I. Call to Order and Roll Call

- A. Meeting called to order at 3:05 PM.
- B. Members Present: Eileen Mariano, Brigitte Davila, Win-Mon Kyi, Joana Feit, Calvin Quock, Maria Su, Dr. Lisa Cooper Wilkins, Alisa Messer, Conny Ford, Malinalli Villalobos, Gordon Mar (represented by Obai Rambo)
- C. Members Absent: Angelica Campos, Tyler Wu, Nikki Hatfield, Christopher Brodie

II. Adoption of the Agenda

- A. Agenda adopted.
- B. Member Ford motioned; and Member Su seconded.

III. General Public Comments

- A. No public comment.

IV. Resolution to Allow Teleconferenced Meetings Under CA Government Code Section 54953(e)

- A. Resolution adopted.
- B. Member Su motioned; and Member Ford seconded.

V. Review and Approval of May 2022 Minutes

- A. Minutes approved.
- B. Member Su motioned; and Member Feit seconded.

VI. Crow Audit Review

- A. Presentation from Mark Maraccini from Crowe
- B. Two main findings: 1) City College did not provide sufficient evidence to support methodology for allocations of administrative salaries and benefits. 2) Oversight Committee met less frequently than required by the MOU.
- C. Non-audit Procedure: Program is sustainable, but fund balance is above 50% and expected to grow and will need to be addressed. Recommends more detail in MOU on what can and can't be included in administrative costs, particularly IT costs. Add cap to administrative costs in MOU.
- D. Member Comments:
 - Member Davila asked what would need to fully remediate? Crowe described the documentation needed for administrative salaries and benefits
 - Member Messer wanted to know if executive-level salary and benefits were remediated. Crow confirmed that this had been remediated.

- Member Ford noted that projection there will be \$23 million in fund balance in 22/23 as a source that could be used for addressing outstanding fees. Member Su responded that Chancellor submitted memo to address outstanding fees.
 - Member Messer, in response to Nonaudit Procedure 4, noted that Free City is a financial aid program and not meant to generate revenue for City College. Member Su confirms this assertion and wants to have conversation also about how we recruit new students and keep current students.
 - Member Feit unable to provide students who want dual-enrollment and wants to discuss how we can increase dual-enrollment and provide more revenue to college.
 - Member Villalobos notes that student focus and student-centered is key.
- E. Public Comment
- Chancellor Martin described new process being implemented for time and reports in response to first finding.

VII. Update on City College

- A. Chancellor Martin presents memo asking for \$6 million in funding support for addressing outstanding fees.
- B. Member Cooper-Wilkins presented update on City College
- Small decrease in student participation and significant increase in repayment and dropped units
 - Decrease in grants, likely due to units being dropped
- C. Priya Chaplot and Giovanni Sosa present RP Group report:
- Free City students have higher persistence, higher mean units earned than non-Free city. This holds across Race/Ethnicity and age group. Unintended consequence is that it may increase gaps between race/ethnicity in units earned.
 - Recommendations: 1) Articulate clear program goals, 2) Increase Free City participation, progress, and completion among disproportionately impacted, 3) Remove unintended barriers, 4) Maximize students' access to and use of all student financial stability supports available, 5) Ensure that continuing students know about and can access relevant supports
- D. Member Comments
- Member Messer would like further opportunity to speak with RP Group. Member Cooper-Wilkins, this was extent to which we've engaged RP Group, but Oversight Committee can continue engagement.
 - Member Su good first step and wants to know how to continue this relationship.
 - Chair Davila wants to know how much immigration status affects Free City? RP Group does not have data
- E. No Public Comment

VIII. Discussion of Free City Funds

- A. Vice Chancellor Al-amin presented memo on request for funding for outstanding fees and addressing audit finding on administrative staff salary and benefit documentation. \$6 million for all City College student outstanding student fees.
- B. Member Comments
- Member Ford asks about administrative costs of covering outstanding fees? What other costs does this outstanding fee estimate not cover? Dr. Al-amin says working more on admin cost documentation. Describes breakout of outstanding fee estimates as including more than Free City students and cover all student except for fees associated with student classes (e.g. materials and supplies).
 - Member Su asks for clarification that \$6 million is for entire student population. Dr. Al-amin confirms. Member Su reminds that Free City funds are General Fund City dollars and not sure if we could cover out-of-state or international fees and need to set parameters on how much money we're talking about.
 - Member Ford requested all fees calculated not included in this report
 - Member Feit says that all dual-enrollment is covered, can this money be applied to these students? Pay for contract ed for additional dual-enrollment courses, can this be impacted by these extra fees?

- Member Cooper-Wilkins hearing that we want to know all fees associated with San Francisco residents only, whether Free City or not. Dr. Al-amin says this is \$2.9 million.
- Member Messer wants to know if we're having more discussion on dual-enrollment. Would like to understand more. Noted that students only realize they have outstanding fees when they try to re-enroll and are prevented from doing so, and we're trying to remove that obstacle.
- Member Villalobos dropping classes after deadline is where core of debt is at.
- Member Ford can we set a goal for accomplishing this for all local San Francisco Free City college students and up and running before next semester.
- Member Feit noted that dual-enrollment goes through same barriers. We pay their fees for them, and that becomes their first impression of City College is that there are barriers.
- Chair Davila is there a way to notify that this debt exists.
- Maria Su noting that technology seems to be part of the barrier, so we should find out ways to help enrollment

C. No public comment

IX. Future Agenda Items and Member Comments

- A. Chair Davila asks how we can continue this discussion. Jay Liao noted that we will continue to include outstanding fee discussion on next agenda.

X. Adjournment

Meeting adjourned at 4:59 pm.